

SEDIMENTATION AND GAS PRODUCTION OF THE
UPPER DEVONIAN BENSON SAND IN NORTH-CENTRAL WEST VIRGINIA —
A MODEL FOR EXOGEOSYNCLINAL MID-FAN TURBIDITES OFF
A DELTA COMPLEX.

DISSERTATION

Submitted To The Graduate School
of
West Virginia University

In Partial Fulfillment Of The Requirements For
The Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

by

Mujeeb-ur-Rehman Cheema, M. Sc.

Morgantown
West Virginia

1977

ABSTRACT

The Benson interval, a 40 to 125-foot (12 to 38 meters) thick sequence of argillaceous siltstone and shale, caps a 600 to 950-foot (183 to 290 meters) thick silty-sandy basal tongue of the Upper Devonian Chemung Group in the 1,225 square-mile (1971 square kilometer) area in north-central West Virginia. Synthesis of data from geophysical logs of 1,000 wells, 7 cores, and gas production records indicates that the interval is a proximal turbidite system constituting a submarine fan at the toe of the Catskill delta complex, from a single source. Cruziana facies of trace fossils suggests deposition in neritic waters. Gas production is facies controlled with secondary influence by compaction-generated structural highs.

The Benson interval is subdivided into lower, middle and upper Benson. The lower and upper are further divisible into three sandstone units each, whereas the middle Benson is a single sandstone unit. The seven sandstone units are in turn, composed of several argillaceous siltstone to fine-grained sandstone turbidite beds. Extensive burrowing has reduced the porosity of the lower Benson and of the middle Benson in some areas. The upper Benson is the principal gas reservoir in north-central West Virginia and, thus, is studied in detail.

The three sandstone units of the upper Benson offlap westward. The oldest sandstone unit is the thickest and exhibits thinning of successive siltstone-sandstone turbidite beds, east-west linear trends, evidence for an erosive base, and has a gas pay-zone confined

to thicker turbidites near its base. As the fan prograded westward with time and the depositional slope decreased, thinner, younger sandstone units were deposited, imparting second order north-south trends on the predominant east-west trends. These two units, individually, show thicker successive turbidite beds and gas pay-zones restricted to their upper parts.

The interpreted shallow-water submarine fan exhibits mid-fan growth patterns with channelized deposits in the east and aggradational lobes to the west. Three facies, inner-lobe, outer-lobe and inter-lobe are identified, in the order of decreasing aggregate sandstone thickness and gas production. Thicker pay zone, lower argillaceous content, better sorting, higher porosity, presence of a highly radioactive streak, higher first-year production, and higher values of gas-production index (theoretic measure of gas production) show a close affinity with thicker aggregate sandstone.

The production appears to be independent of anticlines, fractures and structural lineaments. Initial open flow of gas is greater in the east where higher permeabilities occur in the channelized deposits.

Single source, laterally restricted flow and thinning-upward sequence near the source, fan progradation leading to radial dispersal and thickening-upward sequences away from the source, dilution of turbidite flows on the basin flank before reaching the basin axis, neritic water depth, and thin, straight and elongate facies, in response to tectonic stability and less storage capacity as exhibited by the upper Benson, constitutes a model for exogeosynclinal mid-fan turbidite.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS -----	ii
LIST OF FIGURES -----	vi
ABSTRACT -----	ix
INTRODUCTION -----	1
BENSON STRATIGRAPHY -----	4
Upper Benson -----	6
Lower and Middle Benson -----	13
TURBIDITE ORIGIN -----	15
Core description -----	16
Dispersal trends -----	27
GAS POTENTIAL -----	31
Lithologic traits -----	39
Pay zone -----	39
Hot streak -----	40
Production traits -----	41
Natural open flow -----	42
First-year production -----	42
Gas production index -----	43
Structural traits -----	43
FACIES -----	45
Facies description -----	46
Inner-lobe facies -----	46
Outer-lobe facies -----	46
Inter-lobe facies -----	46
Changes in turbidite style -----	48

	<u>Page</u>
Transverse changes -----	57
Longitudinal changes -----	57
Vertical changes -----	58
Classical proximal turbidites -----	58
DEPOSITIONAL MODEL FOR THE BENSON INTERVAL -----	63
Regional considerations -----	69
CONCLUSIONS-----	72
REFERENCES -----	75
APPENDIX I: Graphic description of Benson Cores -----	79
VITA -----	116
APPROVAL PAGE -----	117

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>FIGURE</u>	<u>Page</u>
1. Location of the study area in West Virginia -----	2
2. Generalized subsurface lithostratigraphic column showing position of various Middle to lower Upper Devonian gas producing sands in north-central West Virginia -----	3
3. Comparison of log and core data -----	5
4. Plot showing close correspondence between gamma-ray log and sand percent -----	7
5. Subdivisions of the Benson interval -----	8
6. Linear correlation between API units (log) and clay % (core) in upper Benson -----	10
7. Longitudinal (east-west) cross-sections showing gamma-ray log signatures, and geometry of various sandstone units of the Benson interval -----	11
8. Transverse (north-south) cross-sections showing gamma-ray log signatures, and geometry of various sandstone units of the Benson interval -----	12
9. Control of sand positions on gamma-ray log signatures of upper Benson -----	14
10. Location of Benson cores -----	17
11. a: X-ray radiograph print of <u>ae</u> bed showing graded nature of division <u>a</u> . b: X-ray radiograph print of base-cut Bouma bed ---	19
12. X-ray radiograph print showing Bouma bed and flame structure in a Benson turbidite bed of intermediate thickness -----	20
13. Photographs showing scour features and tool marks: (a) Shell hash at the base of a turbidite bed; (b) Scour base of a turbidite bed; (c) Prod marks; (d) Flute casts -----	21

<u>Figure</u>	<u>Page</u>
14. Photographs showing trace fossils and groove casts: (a) <u>Chondrites</u> ; (b) <u>Teichichnus</u> ; (c) Groove casts; (d) <u>Corophioides</u> -----	23
(e) Photograph showing load features	
(f) Photograph showing flame structure ----	24
15. X-ray radiograph print of a lower Benson turbidite bed, showing extensive burrowing resulting in porosity reduction -----	25
16. Sand isolith map of the lower Benson -----	29
17. Sand isolith map of the middle Benson -----	30
18. Sand isolith map of the upper Benson -----	31
19. Benson field in north-central West Virginia --	33
20. Benson interval showing Hot Streak in the upper Benson -----	34
21. Pay-zone thickness of the Benson interval ----	35
22. Thickness of the Hot Streak in the upper Benson -----	37
23. Characteristics of the Hot Streak -----	38
24. Natural open flow of gas from the Benson interval -----	41
25. First-year production of the upper Benson ----	43
26. Gas production Index of the upper Benson using density-resistivity logs -----	44
27. Structural contour map on the base of the Benson interval -----	45
28. Correspondence between compaction-generated structural highs and thicker sand in upper Benson -----	47
29. Lineament map of north-central West Virginia -----	50
30. Facies of the upper Benson -----	52

<u>Figure</u>	<u>Page</u>
31. Cross-section showing facies of the upper Benson -----	55
32. Distribution pattern of the three sands of the upper Benson -----	56
33. Correlation between ABC Index and interval thickness (ten-beds groups moving average) in the Benson cores -----	59
34. Plot showing negative correlation between sand percent and number of beds in the Benson cores -----	61
35. Suggested depositional model for Benson -----	69
36. Gamma-ray log correlation showing E-W thickness-trend reversal within Tully-Catskill interval in north-central West Virginia -----	70

CONCLUSIONS

1. The Benson interval and probably the entire lower part of the upper Devonian sequence (lower Chemung) of north-central West Virginia is a shallow water turbidite association, and is neither winnowed near-shore sandy muds and delta-front deposits as envisioned by Dennison (1971), nor off-shore bar sequences as interpreted by Roth (1975). Granting the turbidite origin of the 'Catskill delta complex' of central Pennsylvania (Walker, 1971) it is possible that the entire Chemung section of the study area may be turbidite to near-shore in origin. Thus, a detailed study of the Riley, Balltown and Speechley sandstones is warranted.
2. No association exists between thicker sandstones and thicker shales in the proximal turbidite milieu of the Benson interval.
3. In proximal turbidites, positive correlation exists between sandstone thickness (percent) and flow regime.
4. Reduction in the sand content of the turbidite currents precedes the change from the upper to lower flow regimes. Higher sediment content of the currents is, thus, the driving mechanism.
5. The Benson interval exhibits mid-fan facies association and dispersal pattern. Inner-lobe, outer-lobe and inter-lobe facies are defined in that order of decreasing aggregate sandstone, turbidite bed thickness and production.
6. The aggregate sandstone thickness is the most important attribute for construction of the facies map. It is also the dominant control on porosity and production, as both of these are higher in areas with thicker aggregate sandstone.

7. Mapping of the hot streak distribution in the Benson and the enclosing section indicates gross porosity and permeability trends.
8. In the absence of actual production data, Gas Production Index is an appropriate production potential indicator.
9. The Benson is primarily a facies trap with secondary contribution by compaction-generated structural highs.
10. Compaction-generated structural highs are expected in any turbidite system where belts of thick sandstones are deposited over shales. Definition of these highs through high resolution seismic surveys is worth a serious effort.
11. Structures of tectonic origin have no influence on the Benson production, a contradiction to the views of Dennison (1971, p. 1911).
12. Presence of very few fractures and their filled nature (with calcite) shows lack of relationship between fractures and production.
13. The newly defined Weston Structural Lineament and a previously known lineament have no apparent relationship to lithologic and production trends. Further study is warranted.
14. Benson exploration should be extended to the southwestern part of the study area and to the north and south of the study area. Extra care is advised for exploration to the east and west of the present activity.
15. The largely untested 500 to 800 feet (152 to 244 meters) of silty-sandy section underlying the Benson should be explored.

- Deepening of the existing Benson wells may be worthwhile.
16. An understanding of the Riley sands would throw light on the western limits of the area of thick Benson sandstones.
 17. Radioactive log signatures, typical of fluvial channels or river mouth-bars or offshore bars should be interpreted cautiously as similar signatures are generated by turbidite systems.
 18. Gamma-ray logs of proximal turbidite systems effectively resolve sandstone percentage and average bed thickness trends for intervals as thin as one foot. It is concluded, therefore, that these logs can be used for detailed qualitative interpretation of turbidites, and that emphatic denial of this possibility by Bouma (1972, p. 205) is questionable.
 19. Density of one radioactive log per square mile is more than sufficient to interpret classical turbidites. At least one core is necessary, however.